



**SUMMARY OF THE WORKSHOP MAY 17, 2019 AND
MINUTES OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY MEETING MAY 18, 2019**

KYRENIA, NORTH CYPRUS

The annual meetings of CEENQA were held this year on 17-18 May 2019 in Kyrenia at Cratos Premium Hotel & Spa.

The North Cyprus Higher Education Planning, Evaluation, Accreditation and Coordination Council (YÖDAK) generously hosted the event. On Friday evening, the participants had a fine dinner at the Hotel with live music. On Saturday afternoon, following the General Assembly and lunch, a guided tour to Kyrenia was offered to the participants. During the tour, the participants had the opportunity to visit the Bellapais monastery, Kyrenia Castle and the town center.

The **participants list** of the General Assembly is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 1**.

WORKSHOP MAY 17

The theme of the workshop on 17 May was ***INVOLVEMENT OF STAKEHOLDERS IN EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE***. At first, Cristina Ghitulica, President of CEENQA, and Professor Akile Buke, President of YÖDAK, welcomed the participants. CEENQA was also honored by a visit from HE Mustafa Akıncı, President of the Turkish Republic of North Cyprus, who welcomed all participants to North Cyprus and spoke about the importance of quality assurance in higher education for the future and development of a country.

Afterwards, the workshop's participants gave their presentations in accordance with the programme.

Christoph Grolimund, president of ENQA, presented a discussion of the concept of "stakeholder" and a close reading of the ESG, leading to the result that students seemed to be the most important stakeholders for external quality assurance in HEI. Afterwards, Monika Skadborg from ESU elaborated on the involvement of students and, more importantly, illustrated how to ensure that students can be an active part in quality assurance.

Cristina Ghitulica then presented the results of survey among CEENQA members about stakeholder involvement in CEENQA member agencies and highlighted the points for further discussion.

Last, but not least, Stefan Delplace, the secretary general emeritus from EURASHE, spoke about the evolution and perspectives of stakeholder involvement in quality assurance from a professional HE's point of view.

Jordan Petrescu from the Romanian Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education, Tiia Bach from the Quality Agency for Higher and Vocational Education, Georg Seppmann from Evaluierungsagentur Baden-Württemberg, İbrahim Durak from the Medical Education Programs Evaluation and Accreditation Association, as well as Olgun Cicek from the North



Cyprus Higher Education Planning, Evaluation, Accreditation and Coordination Council illustrated the involvement of stakeholders in their agency.

All presentations, which were given by the speakers, are available on the CEENQA website (www.ceenqa.org).

The **programme of the workshop** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 2**.

EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING MAY 17

The CEENQA Board meeting proceeded in accordance with the agenda that was sent to board members before the meeting. The **agenda of the Board Meeting** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 3**.

1.1. The agenda was approved unanimously.

2. and **3.** The Board discussed the items on the agenda for the General Assembly in detail, in particular

- New or prospective members:

- Potential agencies: The **Serbian** agency NEAQA has expressed interest in joining CEENQA. A representative of the agency will observe the GA and gave a short presentation about the agency. The **Azerbaijani** agency is partnered with AIKA in a twinning project. They will meet again in June and Jolanta Silka will keep in touch regarding CEENQA membership. **Belarus**: Contact has been made, but the agency has not reacted so far. After a reasonable amount of time has passed, they will be contacted again. **Georgia**: After being contacted, the agency said, they would discuss CEENQA membership internally and would contact CEENQA if interested. So far, they did not get in touch with CEENQA again, but Martina Vidlakova will follow-up on this during the year. **Macedonia**: The agency underwent some changes, but expressed interest in applying for CEENQA membership when the new agency is fully operational. Cristina Ghitulica will check on their status periodically. **Montenegro**: The agency expressed interest in joining CEENQA. The board will follow up on this. **Ukraine**: The newly established agency is interested to grow and to become members of CEENQA, but currently more concerned with becoming operational. In the meantime, they are open to collaboration.
- Elbaasy: The board discusses the application of Elbaasy. The Kirgiz agency applied in December 2018/January 2019, the board asked for clarification of the submitted information in March and April. The board will assess the additional information together with the application within the next few weeks and send out a proposal to vote to all members.
- ILAD: ILAD applied in May 2019. The board will assess application within the next few weeks and send out a proposal to vote to all members.

- regarding Board elections:

- Raphaela Forst told the board that Achim Hopbach resigned and that Martina Vidlakova and Duska Radmanovic are up for re-election. Duska Radmanovic informed the board that she would not be available for another term as vice president. **Hence, the General Assembly will have to elect a new Vice President.**



Raphaela Forst informed the board that there were six candidates for board membership, namely Akile Buke, Siyka Chavdarova, Olgun Cicek, İbrahim Durak, Duska Radmanovic, and Martina Vidlakova.

As for the position of **the Vice President, Cristina Ghitulica suggested Martina Vidlakova as a candidate for the Vice presidency.**

- Since Jessica Sabban's departure from CEENQA, Raphaela Forst had taken over her tasks and responsibilities as CEENQA's Secretary General. The General Assembly, which will take place on May 18, 2019, will decide if Raphaela Forst is continuing to be CEENQA's new Secretary General.
- regarding finances:
 - **Raphaela Forst**, together with Treasurer **Stefan Handke**, will present **the fiscal 2018 overview and 2019 budget in accordance with the treasurer's report**, sent to all members. The Treasurer will ask the GA members to discharge the President and Board regarding the 2018 financial report.
 - **Martina Vidlakova** will **talk** about **staff exchange**.
 - The board agreed, considering the financial reserves accrued in the CEENQA account, **to propose to the GA to keep the annual membership fee at 600 EUR.**
- Upcoming workshop and General Assembly 2019
 - Cristina Ghitulica informed the board that Martina suggested to have the General Assembly of 2019 in Prague. However, there will be an open call for offers to host the event and, in the case of two or more proposal, a vote.

GENERAL ASSEMBLY MAY 18

The General Assembly proceeded in accordance with the agenda that was sent to members before the meeting. The **agenda of the General Assembly** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 4**.

1. Welcome and Introduction

The General Assembly was chaired by President Cristina Ghitulica, who welcomed the participants to the meeting.

2. Acceptance of agenda

The adapted agenda was **accepted by unanimous vote**. The adaptations concerning the agenda were as follows: The GA decided to have a group photo before the coffee break.

The attendance list was displayed on a table outside the conference room and the participants could sign it.

3. Status report Tempus/Erasmus+ projects

3.1 Projects in 2018

Raphaela Forst reported on the **Erasmus+ project** in which CEENQA contributed as a partner.

The **QUAERE** project (October 2015 – 2018) was aimed at improving the Internal and External Quality Assurance System in the Ukraine. CEENQA completed the following tasks:



development of criteria for reviewing degree programmes and development of a template for the Self-Assessment-Report (SAR), teaching a workshop on SAR and piloting reviews at Ukrainian partner universities. CEENQA submitted the final documentation in November 2018 and is waiting for the payment of the final 10% of the grant.

The presentation on the project is attached to these minutes as **Annex 5**.

3.2 Staff exchange/ internships

Martina Vidlakova reported on the status of the **staff exchange** between CEENQA members. Following the call in winter 2018 and the extension of the deadline to January 2019, ten agencies are participating. During the last week, information about the match and the further procedure was sent to the participating agencies via mail. Martina Vidlakova encouraged the participating agencies to share their experiences with the staff exchange by submitting a short note to the newsletter. It was also suggested to broaden the staff exchange to not only staff members, but also leadership positions. Martina Vidlakova welcomed the suggestion and will consider including leadership positions for the next round of staff exchange.

3.3 PR / Newsletter

Raphaela Forst informed the GA that the next newsletter will be published in June and reminded them to send in their contributions until May 31. With regard to the CEENQA website, (www.ceenqa.org), she explained that the next big update would concern the information about the individual CEENQA members. For this, each member agency is asked to update the contact details, using the presented template, as well as write a brief introductory text about the agency. Members are asked to send in their revised information until June 14. The updated information would then be uploaded to the CEENQA website.

Regarding the “activities” section, Raphaela Forst urged members to send in their news and activities, like conferences or agency highlights, in order to fill the section. For example, news sent to ENQA could also be sent to CEENQA and disseminated on the website and through the newsletter.

Cristina Ghitulica presented the new CEENQA brochure, a short leaflet containing information about CEENQA. She invited members to take along the brochure to conferences to improve the visibility of network. The pdf of the brochure can be found at https://www.ceenqa.org/wp-content/uploads/CEENQA-brochure_2018.pdf.

In order to improve the website and to generate more interaction within the network, it was suggested to implement a website 2.0 with a login for members and a forum that could increase the connection and stability of member interaction. It was further discussed whether it would be possible to track the hits on the website. The board asked the secretary general to see whether this is feasible and how much it would cost to establish and run these features. The board also urged member agencies to put a link to the CEENQA website on their agency homepage to increase the visibility of the network and to spread awareness.

4. New Membership

4.1 Announcement of Voting Result and Presentation of the new member

ANACEC (Republic of Moldova)



The GA voted via e-mail and unanimously on membership of ANACEC. ANACEC has been voted to be a full member of CEENQA.

Stela Guvir presented the agency.

4.2. Status of application for full membership

Elbaasy (Kyrgyz Republic)

Cristina Ghitulica explained that Elbaasy applied for membership, but that the information in the application form was in parts unclear. The board has asked for, and received, clarification. The board will analyze this new information. The board will send its assessment of the application and a proposal to vote to CEENQA members in the next few weeks.

ILAD (Turkey):

ILAD applied for membership at the beginning of May. The board will discuss the application. It will send its assessment of the application and a proposal to vote to all CEENQA members in the next few weeks.

4.3. Vote on suspension of voting rights of AKKORK (Russia)

AKKORK has not paid the membership fee for 2017, 2018 and 2019. The board therefore proposed to suspend the voting rights of AKKORK.

The GA voted openly and unanimously on the suspension of voting rights of AKKORK. AKKORK's voting rights will be suspended.

The board will also contact AKKORK in order to clarify why the fees have not been paid, but also to reach a workable solution.

4.4 Vote on applicant for full membership: ZEvA (Germany)

ZEvA became a member with observer status in 2018 and now applied for full membership.

The GA voted openly and unanimously on the membership of ZEvA. ZEvA has been voted to be a full member.

4.5 Status of CEENQA membership / potential members

CEENQA consists of 35 members from 22 different countries (status Mai 2019).

Potential members are:

Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Macedonia, Montenegro, Serbia and Ukraine.

Cristina Ghitulica informed the GA about the latest developments of those countries:

Serbia: The representative of the Serbian agency NEAQA observed the GA and gave a short presentation about the agency. They intend to join CEENQA within the year.



Azerbaijan: Cristina Ghitulica reported that the agency is partnered with a CEENQA member agency in a twinning project. They will meet again in June and Jolanta Silka will keep in touch regarding CEENQA membership.

Belarus: Contact has been made, but the agency has not reacted so far. The board will keep in touch with the agency.

Georgia: After being contacted, the agency said, they would discuss CEENQA membership internally and would contact CEENQA if interested. So far, they did not get in touch with CEENQA again, but the board will follow-up on this during the year.

Macedonia: The agency underwent some changes, but expressed interest in applying for CEENQA membership when the new agency is operational.

Montenegro: The agency expressed interest in joining CEENQA. The board will follow up on this.

Ukraine: The newly established agency is interested to grow and to become members of CEENQA, but currently more concerned with becoming operational. In the meantime, they are open to collaboration.

Cristina Ghitulica encouraged all member agencies to spread the information about CEENQA and to use their network for this. Ibrahim Durak gave the example of the platform of Turkish agencies, which meet regularly, and offered to invite board members to present CEENQA.

5. Finances

The financial report 2018 and budget 2019 are attached to these Minutes as **Annex 6**.

5.1 Financial Report 2018

Stefan Handke and Raphaela Forst informed the congregation about the **financial year 2018**. The budget is divided into two parts: a) operating budget and b) project budget. With regard to the operating budget, the membership fees for 2018 have not been completely received; AKKORK, NAA and ARSA still have to pay the membership fee. Raphaela also informed the GA that there had been some expenses on projects. The corresponding income either was received in 2017 or is expected for 2019. As such, the figures show a positive operational result and a negative project result. With regard to the operational budget of 2018, CEENQA has slight surplus of 159,41 €. With respect to the project budget of 2018, there has been a loss of -5.957,04 € but the income received in 2017 or expected for 2019 cover the costs completely.

5.2 Report of the treasurer/ financial discharge of board members

Stefan Handke commented on his **Treasurer's Report**, sent to members before the meeting (**Annex 7** to these Minutes). He informed the participants that he crosschecked the bank account and balance sheets and it is worthwhile to note that still reserves are available. To sum it up, although the financial situation of a non-profit association is always difficult, CEENQA's financial situation is substantial and positive. Stefan is positive about the future since CEENQA is planning to win new members. The increase of new members will lead to an increase in income.



The members **voted unanimously to discharge the Board and the President as well as the Vice President for the financial report 2018.**

5.3 Budget 2019

Stefan Handke and Raphaela Forst presented the budget plan for 2019. In doing so, they informed the GA that in terms of the operational budget a surplus of 3.150,75 € is anticipated. As for the project budget of 2019, a surplus of 12.127,04 € is expected as there are no current projects, but CEENQA is to receive the final grant for the QUAERE project.

The members **voted unanimously to approve the budget plan for 2019.**

5.4 Membership Fees

The chair informed the members on the result of the pre-discussion of the Executive Board to retain the annual membership fee at **600 Euro**. The members **approved the membership fee unanimously**.

Regarding the unpaid membership fees, the board was asked to contact the agencies directly and attempt to clarify the situation. It was further suggested to word the payment reminders more sharply and to state directly the negative consequences of not paying the membership fees.

6. Confirmation of Secretary General

The board recommended that Raphaela Forst should be confirmed as Secretary General and that the CEENQA headquarter should remain located in Düsseldorf, Germany, since the network is registered there. Additionally, all documents as well as CEENQA's bank account are located in Düsseldorf. The GA approved that suggestion. Thus, Raphaela Forst is confirmed as Secretary General.

7. Votes

7.1 Setting-up vote-counting group

The members received voting forms and Cristina Ghitulica explains the GA the voting procedure as given in the CEENQA Statute, Section 9. **Raphaela Forst, Georg Seppmann, and Ilva Grigorjeva** were appointed to build the Vote-Counting Group.

7.2 Presentation by board candidates

In preparation to the General Assembly, six nominations were received for the Executive Board:

Akile Buke from the North Cyprus Higher Education Planning, Evaluation, Accreditation and Coordination Council (YÖDAK), **Sikya Chavdarova** from the National Evaluation and Accreditation Agency (NEAA), **Olgun Cicek** from the North Cyprus Higher Education Planning, Evaluation, Accreditation and Coordination Council (YÖDAK), **Ibrahim Durak** from the Medical Education Programs Evaluation and Accreditation Association (TEPDAD), **Duska Radmanovic** from the Higher Education Accreditation Agency of Republika Srpska (HEAARS) and **Martina Vidlakova** from the National Accreditation Bureau for Higher Education (NAB).



The chair asked the assembly if anyone would like to nominate additional candidates. No other person was nominated.

All nominees gave a brief presentation on themselves and on their view about CEENQA and its possible activities in the future.

Cristina Ghitulica thanked the outgoing board members for their dedicated work.

7.3 Election of members of the Executive Board

The members present voted on six Board candidates: **Akile Buke, Sikya Chavdarova, Olgun Cicek, Ibrahim Durak, Duska Radmanovic, and Martina Vidlakova.**

7.4 Results of Vote announced by Vote-Counting Group

Cristina informed the GA that all votes were valid. The result of the vote is as follows:

Akile Buke received 5, Sikya Chavdarova 7, Olgun Cicek 9, Ibrahim Durak 8, Duska Radmanovic 9, Martina Vidlakova 17 votes.

Martina Vidlakova, Duska Radmanovic and Olgun Cicek were elected as board members.

7.5 Presentation by Board candidates for Vice Presidency

The new board had to nominate the candidates for the position of the Vice President. The board nominated **Martina Vidlakova** to run for the position of the new President.

The chair officially asked the Martina if she wanted to run for the vacant position. **She willingly accepted the nomination.**

7.6 Election of Vice President of the Executive Board

The election of the Vice President took place via the voting forms.

7.7 Results of Vote announced by Vote-Counting Group

Martina was voted to be Vice President for a two years term. She received 16 votes with two invalid votes. She accepted the voting.

The chair congratulated the newly elected board members and thanked the participants for their support.

8. Reports by CEENQA members

The reports of the members took place both during the vote counting and after the voting. The representatives from ASCAL, ANQA, AQ Austria, NEAA, ASHE, NAB, EKKA, ACQUIN, ASIIN, EVALAG, IAAR, IQAA, KAA, AIKA, SKVC, ANACEC, YÖDAK, PKA, ARACIS, SQAA/NAKVIS, TEPDAD, and FEDEK reported on latest developments, activities and events in their agencies.

9. Any other business



Cristina Ghitulica asked for offers to host the 2020 meetings. **Martina Vidlakova** from **NAB** as well as **Ibrahim Durak** from **TEPDAD** offered to host the 2020 meetings. The GA voted openly and decided that **NAB will host the 2020 CEENQA meetings**, which will take place **in the following year in Prague**.

For the sake of transparency, the voting results were as follows: NAB – Czech Republic received 10 vote and TEPDAD – Turkey received 7 votes.

Cristina Ghitulica thanked both agencies for their kind offer. She also asked all agencies to send suggestions for potential topics for the next workshop via e-mail to secretariat@ceenqa.org. During the discussion, it was suggested to design the next workshop as a bit more interactive, for example with small group discussions, and to have a moderator to take care of any terminology issues in order to avoid several explanations of the same terms.

The Chair once more thanked **YÖDAK for the generous and proficient organization** of the General Assembly and workshop and closed the meeting.

Düsseldorf, May 20, 2019

These minutes were prepared by Raphaela Forst, Secretary General and approved by Cristina Ghitulica, CEENQA President.