



## SUMMARY OF THE WORKSHOP MAY 11, 2018 AND MINUTES OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY MEETING MAY 12, 2018

TIRANA, ALBANIA

The annual meetings of CEENQA were held this year on 11-12 May 2018 in Tirana at Tirana International Hotel. The **Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education in Albania (ASCAL)** generously hosted the event. On Friday evening, the congregation visited Durres. The participants could take part in a walking tour through Durres. There, the participants visited the Amphitheatre of Durres as well as the beach promenade. Afterwards, the participants had a fine dinner at the seafood restaurant ARTUR. On Saturday afternoon, following the General Assembly and lunch, a bus tour to Berat was offered to the participants. There the participants had the opportunity to visit Berat Fortress and the National Iconographic Museum “Onufri”.

The **participants list** of the General Assembly is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 1**.

### WORKSHOP MAY 11

The theme of the workshop on 11 May was **IMPLEMENTING ESG 2015: VIEWS, EXPERIENCES AND GOOD PRACTICES**. At first, Professor Arjan Gjonca, the President of the Accreditation Board of ASCAL, as well as Dhurata Bozo, director of ASCLA, welcomed the participants. Afterwards, the workshop’s participants gave their presentations in accordance with the programme.

Liia Lauri from the Estonian Quality Agency for Higher and Vocational Education as well as Vesna Dodiković Jurković from the Croatian Agency for Science and Higher Education illustrated their best practice examples on thematic analysis.

All presentations, which were given by the speakers, are available on the CEENQA website ([www.ceenqa.org](http://www.ceenqa.org)).

The **programme of the workshop** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 2**.

### EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING APRIL 28

The CEENQA Board meeting proceeded in accordance with the agenda that was sent to board members before the meeting. The **agenda of the Board Meeting** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 3**.

**1.1. and 1.2.** The agenda and minutes of the last Board meeting were approved unanimously.

**2. and 3.** The Board discussed the items on the agenda for the General Assembly in detail, in particular

- New or prospective members:

- Nora Skaburskiene informed the board on the status quo of potential CEENQA members: Serbia founded a new accreditation agency. They might apply for CEENQA



membership within the following year. With respect to the difficult political situation, nothing has changed in the Ukraine. Belarus might have an agency in five years time. Moldova, Azerbaijan and Macedonia might be prepared to apply for CEENQA membership in the future. As for Montenegro and Georgia, Nora could not provide new information to the board.

- regarding Board elections:

- Marleen Roggan told the board that Ivan Leban would not be available for another term as board member and subsequently as vice president. Nora Skaburskiene informed the board she would not be available as president any longer. Additionally, Izabella Kwiatkowska-Sujka told the board she would not be available for another term as board member and subsequently as treasurer. **Hence, the General Assembly will have to elect a new President as well as a new Vice President. Furthermore, a new treasurer will have to be appointed as well.**

Marleen Roggan informed the board that there were three new candidates for board membership. Namely, Stefan Handke, Akile Buke and Franci Demšar.

As for the position of **the President, Achim Hopbach suggested Daniela-Cristina Ghitulica should run for CEENQA presidency.** In case she will refuse **the proposal, Achim will step in and candidate for the position of the President.**

Duska Radmanovic told the board she would like to stand as a candidate for Vice President.

Marleen suggested Stefan should be CEENQA's new treasurer. The board as well as Stefan approved the idea. **Stefan willingly accepted to take over the responsibilities as the new treasurer.**

- Since Marleen is going to be on maternity leave as of July 2018, she will not be able to work as Secretary General any longer. The potentially new Secretary General Jessica Sabban introduced herself to the board. **The board supported the suggestion that Jessica should take over Marleen's tasks and responsibilities as CEENQA's new Secretary General.** The General Assembly, which will take place on May 12<sup>th</sup>, 2018, will decide if Jessica Sabban is going to be CEENQA's new Secretary General.

- regarding finances:

- **Marleen Roggan**, together with Treasurer **Izabella Kwiatkowska-Sujka**, will present **the fiscal 2017 overview and 2018 budget in accordance with the treasurer's report**, sent to all members. The Treasurer will ask the GA members to discharge the President and Board regarding the 2017 financial report.
- **Martina Vidlakova** will **talk about staff exchange.** Duska informed the board on her behalf about that topic.
- The board agreed that considering the financial reserves accrued in the CEENQA account **to propose to the GA to keep the annual membership fee at 600 EUR.**

- upcoming workshop and General Assembly 2019

- Tallin is going to host the Members Forum in April 2019.
- Nora Skaburskiene informed the board that Martina suggested to have the General Assembly of 2019 in Prague. In order to host the event, the Czech Republic National Accreditation Bureau for Higher Education agency will depend on financial support



given by CEENQA. In case the General Assembly decides to have the next General Assembly in Prague, CEENQA will grant a financial support to NAB.

## GENERAL ASSEMBLY MAY 12

With respect to the first 5 items, the General Assembly proceeded in accordance with the agenda that was sent to members before the meeting. The **agenda of the General Assembly** is attached to these Minutes as **Annex 4**.

### 1. Welcome and Introduction

The General Assembly was chaired by President Nora Skaburskiene, who welcomed the participants to the meeting.

### 2. Acceptance of agenda

The adapted agenda was **accepted by unanimous vote**. The adaptations concerning the agenda were as follows:

The GA decided to have the coffee break after item 5 (finances). Furthermore, item 5 was directly followed by item 7 (votes) and item 7 in turn was followed by item 6 (organizational set-up of CEENQA headquarter).

In terms of the reader's orientation, we decided to present the minutes in the numeric order of the agenda.

The attendance list was displayed on a table outside the conference room and the participants could sign it.

### 3. Status report Tempus/Erasmus+ projects

**3.1** Marleen Roggan reported on the **Tempus and Erasmus+ projects** in which CEENQA contributes as a partner.

**ALIGN** is a project that aims to enable Armenian, Russian, Ukrainian HEIs to achieve alignment of academic programs with NQFs and QA agencies to check the alignment of academic programs with NQFs. CEENQA's tasks in the ALIGN project have been completed.

The **QUAERE** project is aiming at improving the Internal and External Quality Assurance System in the Ukraine. Taking into account the difficult political situation, so far the following tasks have been completed: development of criteria for reviewing degree programmes and development of a template for the Self-Assessment-Report (SAR). Based on the developed criteria 6 Ukrainian partner universities have prepared their SAR for selected degree programmes. So far 2 piloting reviews have already taken place while 4 of the 6 piloting reviews are still open. Those 4 remaining reviews are as follows:

**AIC** (Latvia) is going to review the Master's Degree Programmes Economic Cybernetics and Informatics at the Sumy State University.

**ACQUIN** (Germany) is going to evaluate the Bachelor's and Master's Degree Programme History and Archaeology at Berdyansk State Pedagogical University.



**ANQA** (Armenia) is going to visit Chernivtsi University. There they are going to evaluate two Master Degree Programmes: Applied Mathematics and Germanic Languages: English Language and Literature.

**SKVC** (Lithuania) is going to evaluate the Master's Degree Programmes Economic Cybernetics and Applied Mathematics at Khmelnytskyi national University.

The presentation on the projects is attached to these minutes as **Annex 5**.

**3.3** Martina Vidlakova reported on the status of the **staff exchange** between CEENQA members. She informed the GA that various visits took place within the previous period such as:

The BiH Higher Education Accreditation Agency of Republica Srpska (HEAARS) visited the Polish Accreditation Committee (PKA). During that visit Duska Radmanovic had the opportunity to take part as an observer in an onsite visit at the University of Warsaw. Furthermore, the Croatian Agency for Science and Higher Education (ASHE) and the Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education in Albania (ASCAL) visited one another. In addition to that, the Lithuania Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education (SKVC) visited the Austrian Quality Assurance and Accreditation Agency (AQ Austria). The respective participants informed the GA that they could compare their accreditation procedures with one another and exchange information concerning best practices as well as difficult cases. The participants as well as Martina encouraged the other members to take part in the exchange programme.

**3.4** With regard to Public Relations, Marleen introduced the domain of the relaunched version of the CEENQA website ([www.ceenqa.org](http://www.ceenqa.org)). In doing so, she informed the GA on the website's structure and its new features. Marleen suggested to publish a picture showing all members of this year's GA on the new website. This idea was highly appreciated by the GA. Furthermore, she informed the GA that the pictures of all CEENQA members would be published on the website as well. Nora pointed to the fact that the category "activities" is still empty and needs to be update as soon as possible. The GA agreed that ideas, which can be published in that category, need to be discussed. Marleen promised to continue working on the website in order for the homepage to look even more alive.

## **4. New Membership**

### **4.1 Votes on applications for full membership**

ECAQA (Kazakhstan)

**The GA voted openly and unanimously on membership of ECAQA. ECAQA has been voted to be a full member of CEENQA.**

### **4.2. Votes on applications for observer membership**

HEPDAK

**The GA voted openly and unanimously on membership of HEPDAK. HEPDAK has been voted to be a member with observer status.**

ZEVA



**The GA voted openly and unanimously on the membership of ZEvA. ZEvA has been voted to be a member with observer status.**

### **4.3. Potential members**

CEENQA consists of 32 members from 21 different countries (status April 2018).

#### **Potential members are:**

**Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Macedonia, Moldavia, Montenegro, Serbia and Ukraine.**

**Nora informed the GA about the latest developments of those countries:**

**Azerbaijan:** Nora reported that they had become more and more active in ENQA and that she had invited them to become a member. Although one has to keep in mind that they are financially struggling.

**Belarus:** The Belarus agency expressed its interest to apply for membership. But the agency still has to go quite a long way. Nora does not expect them to be prepared for CEENQA membership until 2020/2021.

**Georgia:** Nora informed the GA that she knows very little about the recent developments in Georgia. As far as Nora is concerned, the Georgian agency has undergone a process of structurally based changes in terms of legal and internal reforms.

**Macedonia:** Nora told the GA that Macedonia might be ready to join CEENQA soon, presumably within the following year.

**Moldavia:** Nora reported that the three Moldavian agencies merged into one big agency. That agency focuses on primary and secondary school as well as on higher education. Nora is in touch with the agency and has encouraged them to become a CEENQA member.

**Serbia:** Serbia founded a new accreditation agency by merging the previously existing agencies into one big agency. That agency might apply for CEENQA membership within the following year.

**Ukraine:** As mentioned earlier the difficult situation in the country slowed down the process of development of a working agency. First, a functioning agency needs to be implemented before a follow-up will have an effect.

## **5. Finances**

The financial report 2017 and budget 2018 are attached to these Minutes as **Annex 6**.

**5.1** Marleen Roggan informed the congregation about the **financial year 2017**. The budget is divided into two parts: a) operating budget and b) project budget. With regard to the operating budget the membership fees for 2017 have not been completely received; AKKORK has still to pay its membership fee. Marleen also informed the GA that there had been some expenses on the website in the last year, which have been paid in 2018. In total, the figures show a positive result. With regard to the operational budget of 2017, CEENQA has stable surplus of 2.524,78 €. With respect to the project budget of 2017, the income covers the costs completely.

**5.2** Izabela Kwiatkowska-Sujka commented on her **Treasurer's Report**, sent to members before the meeting (**Annex 7** to these Minutes). She informed the participants that she had





cross-checked the bank account and balance sheets and it is worthwhile to note that still reserves are available. To sum it up, although the financial situation of a non-profit association is always difficult, CEENQA's financial situation is substantial and positive. Izabela is positive about the future since CEENQA is planning to win new members. The increase of new members will lead to an increasing income.

The members **voted unanimously to discharge the Board for the financial report 2017.**

Izabela Kwiatkowska-Sujka informed the GA that she would not be available as treasurer for another term. Thus, a new treasurer will have to be appointed.

**5.3** Marleen presented the budget plan for 2018. In doing so she informed the GA that in terms of the operational budget a surplus of 6.907,17 € is to be expected since CEENQA is planning to gain new members. As for the project budget of 2018 Marleen expected the income to cover the costs.

The members **voted unanimously to approve the budget plan for 2018.**

**5.4** The chair informed the members on the result of the pre-discussion of the Executive Board to retain the annual membership fee at **600 Euro**. The members **approved the membership fee unanimously.**

## **6. Organisational set-up of CEENQA headquarter**

The board recommended that CEENQA headquarter should remain located in Düsseldorf, Germany, since the network is registered there. Additionally, all documents as well as CEENQA's bank account are located in Düsseldorf. The GA approved that suggestion. Thus, **CEENQA headquarter remains located in Düsseldorf until the following GA which will take place in 2019.**

## **7. Votes**

### **7.1 Setting-up vote-counting group**

The members received voting forms and Marleen Roggan explains the GA the voting procedure as given in the CEENQA Statue, Section 9. **Martina Vidlakova, Duska Rdamanovic and Jessica Sabban** were appointed to build the Vote-Counting Group.

### **7.2 Presentation by board candidates**

In preparation to the General Assembly three nominations were received for the Executive Board:

**Stefan Handke** from the Akkreditierungs- Zertifizierungs- und Qualitätssicherungsinstitut (ACQUIN), **Akile Buke** from the North Cyprus Higher Education Planning, Evaluation, Accreditation and Coordination Council (YÖDAK) and **Franci Demšar** from the Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (SQAA).

The chair asked the assembly if anyone would like to nominate additional candidates. **Jolanta Silka** from the Latvian Quality Agency for Higher Education was nominated and she accepted her nomination.



All nominees gave a brief presentation on their view about CEENQA and its possible activities in the future.

Nora thanked the outgoing board members for their dedicated work.

### 7.3 Election of members of the Executive Board

The members present voted on six Board candidates: **Achim Hopbach, Cristina Chitulica, Stefan Handke, Akile Buke, Jolanta Silka and Franci Demšar.**

Nora informed the GA that all votes were valid. The result of the vote is as follows:

**Achim Hopbach received 17, Cristina Chitulica 15, Stefan Handke 15, Jolanta Silka 12 and Franci Demšar 12 votes.**

### 7.4 Election of President and Vice President

The new board had to nominate the candidates for the position of the President and the Vice President. The board nominated **Cristina Ghitulica** to run for the position of the new President.

**Duska Radmanovic** had been nominated by the board to run for the position of the Vice President.

The chair officially asked the two candidates if they wanted to run for the two vacant positions. **Both candidates willingly accepted their nominations.**

**As one person voted against an open vote,** the GA decided to vote anonymously and secretly the President and afterwards the Vice President.

**Maria E. Weber replaced Duska Radmanovic in the vote-counting group.**

**Cristina Chitulica was voted to be President for a two years term. She received 19 votes.**

**Duska Radmanovic was voted to be Vice President for a two years term. She received 13 votes.**

**Both elected persons accept the voting.**

The chair congratulated the newly elected board members and thanked the participants for their support. Cristina replaced Nora as the new President within the rest of the GA Meeting.

Cristina thanked the members for their trust and expressed her gratefulness for Nora's dedicated work and the goals she achieved as the outgoing President of CEENQA.

Furthermore, the board nominated **Stefan Handke** to function as **CEENQA's new treasurer.** The GA **decided to vote openly.** Stefan Handke was voted to be the treasurer for the period of one year.

As Marleen will be on maternity leave as of July 2018, the board supported the suggestion that Jessica Sabban should take over Marleen's tasks and responsibilities as CEENQA's new Secretary General. **Jessica Sabban** introduced herself to the GA and she **was appointed to be CEENQA's new Secretary General** until May 2019.

## 8. Reports by CEENQA members

The reports of the members took place in one session directly after the voting part. The representatives from AQ Austria, HEA, HEARS, NEAA, ASHE, NAB, EKKA, ACQUIN,



ASIIN, evalag, HAC, IAAR, KAA, AIKA, SKVC, YÖDAK, PKA, ASCAL, EQAR, ARACIS, SQAA and FEDEK reported on latest developments, activities and events in their agencies.

## 9. Results of Vote

See item 7 above.

## 10. Any other business

Cristina Ghitulica asked for offers to host the 2019 meetings. **Martina Vidlakova** from NAB as well as **Akile** and **Cagri Buke** from YÖDAK and **Petrescu Iordan** from ARACIS suggested to host the 2019 meetings. The GA voted openly and decided that **YÖDAK will host the CEENQA meetings**, which will take place **in the following year in Northern Cyprus**.

For the sake of transparency, the voting results were as follows:

ARACIS – Romania received 6 votes, NAB – Czech Republic received 5 votes and YÖDAK – North Cyprus received 9 votes.

While the vote-counting committee was counting the votes for the election of the new board members, the GA discussed possible topics of the next year's workshop. The following ideas have been collected so far:

- Visibility of Quality Assurance
- Internationalization – mobility and international cooperation
- Involvement of students in Quality Assurance activities (e.g. inviting students from ESU)
- Academic Ethics in Quality Assurance
- What particular developments in Higher Education and Quality Assurance can be found in Eastern and Central Europe?
- 20 years Bologna particular developments might need further attention in the future.

The Chair once more thanked ASCAL **for the generous and proficient organization** of the General Assembly and workshop and closed the meeting.

Düsseldorf, May 24, 2018

These minutes were prepared jointly by Marleen Roggan, outgoing Secretary General and Jessica Sabban, newly appointed Secretary General and approved by Nora Skaburskiene, outgoing President and Ghitulica Daniela-Cristina, newly elected President.