

Involvement of Stakeholders in external Quality Assurance

Kyrenia, 16. May 2019

Christoph Grolimund

What I planned to talk about

Disclaimer: ENQA does not have a view on stakeholder involvement,
but:

- The Concept Stakeholder (vs Shareholder)
- View of the European Standards and Guidelines
- View of the experts in the ENQA coordinated reviews
- View of EQAR's *Policy on the use and interpretation of ESG*
- Thoughts on Stakeholder classification
- Lessons learnt

The concept of „stakeholder“

| Shareholder | Stakeholder |
|--|---|
| Milton Friedman | Edward Freeman: <i>Strategic Management: A Stakeholder Approach.</i> |
| only the owners or shareholders of the company are important | there are other parties involved, including employees, customers, suppliers, financiers, communities, governmental bodies, political groups, trade associations, and trade unions |
| | corporate social responsibility |
| | Stakeholder classification |
| university as republic of scholars | university as managed organization |

ESG 2015

Higher education aims to fulfil multiple purposes; including preparing students for active citizenship, for their future careers (e.g. contributing to their employability), supporting their personal development, creating a broad advanced knowledge base and stimulating research and innovation. **Therefore, stakeholders, who may prioritise different purposes, can view quality in higher education differently and quality assurance needs to take into account these different perspectives.** *Quality*, whilst not easy to define, is mainly a result of the interaction between teachers, students and the institutional learning environment. Quality assurance should ensure a learning environment in which the content of programmes, learning opportunities and facilities are fit for purpose.

“Stakeholders” in the ESG 2015

Part 3

| | |
|--|----|
| 3.1 Activities, policy and processes for quality assurance | xx |
|--|----|

3.2 Official status

| | |
|------------------|---|
| 3.3 Independence | x |
|------------------|---|

3.4 Thematic analysis

3.5 Resources

3.6 Internal quality assurance and professional

| | |
|--|---|
| 3.7 Cyclical external review of agencies | x |
|--|---|

Part 2

2.1 Consideration of internal quality assurance

| | |
|---|----|
| 2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose | xx |
|---|----|

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| 2.3 Implementing processes | x |
|----------------------------|---|

2.4 Peer review experts

2.5 Criteria for outcomes

2.6 Reporting

2.7 Complaints and appeals

„Stakeholders“ in ESG – Part 3

3.1 Activities, policy and processes for quality assurance

Standard:

Agencies should undertake external quality assurance activities as defined in Part 2 of the ESG on a regular basis. They should have clear and explicit goals and objectives that are part of their publicly available mission statement. These should translate into the daily work of the agency. **Agencies should ensure the involvement of stakeholders in their governance and work.**

3.3 Independence

Guidelines:

Operative independence: the definition and operation of the agency's procedures and methods as well as the nomination and appointment of external experts are undertaken independently from third parties such as **higher education institutions, governments and other stakeholders;**

3.7 Cyclical external reviews of agencies

Guidelines:

A periodic external review will help the agency to reflect on its policies and activities. It provides a means for assuring **the agency and its stakeholders** that it continues to adhere to the principles enshrined in the ESG.

„Stakeholders“ in ESG – Part 2

2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose

Standard:

External quality assurance should be defined and designed specifically to ensure its fitness to achieve the aims and objectives set for it, while taking into account relevant regulations. **Stakeholders should be involved in its design and continuous improvement.**

2.3 Implementing processes

Guidelines:

Depending on the design of the external quality assurance system, the institution provides the basis for the external quality assurance through a self-assessment or by collecting other material including supporting evidence. **The written documentation is normally complemented by interviews with stakeholders during a site visit.** The findings of the assessment are summarised in a report (cf. Standard 2.5) written by a group of external experts (cf. Standard 2.4).

ENQA coordinated reviews - compliance

| Standard | FC | SC | PC | NC |
|--|----|----|----|----|
| 3.1 Activities, policy and processes for quality assurance | 13 | 22 | 5 | 0 |
| 3.3 Independence | 26 | 12 | 2 | 0 |
| 3.7 Cyclical external review of agencies | 22 | 13 | 5 | 0 |
| 2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose | 18 | 18 | 4 | 0 |
| 2.3 Implementing processes | 22 | 13 | 4 | 0 |

Key Stakeholders

The panel interviewed all key stakeholders, including SAR working group, CAQAS' members and staff, academic experts, students and employers involved in its processes and representatives of higher education institutions and their conferences, students' conferences and the national authorities.

Almost all of the people the panel met with were experienced academics, students and qa professionals well acquainted with the EHEA jargon ... (IEP).

QAA works in partnership with the providers and funders of higher education, the staff and students in higher education, employers, and other stakeholders.

Review panels on „stakeholder involvement“ – ESG 3.1

- The agency (AEQES) has made extensive efforts to involve a variety of stakeholders in its activities, with particular emphasis in the case of students. The Steering Committee is composed of 24 full members and 24 substitutes, with diverse backgrounds: universities, university colleges, art colleges, adult vocational education institutions, students, trade unions, the civil society, the professional world, and international experts.
- ... all relevant stakeholders interviewed by the panel were (CAQA)
- Additionally, stakeholder participation is ensured through regular inclusion of experts coming from evaluated institutions to the pool (IEP).
- QAA works in partnership with representatives of different bodies – governments and governmental bodies, politicians, civil servants and policy makers, higher education funding bodies, other higher education agencies, individual higher education providers, higher education staff, employers and student organizations.
- “stakeholders” (HCERES, HEA)

Review panels on stakeholder involvement – ESG 2.2

The key stakeholders (representatives of HE institutions, policymakers, representatives of the labour market and students) are involved in the methodological changes as members (AEQES).

... All stakeholders, including representatives of SCONUS and SCOHS and the labour market, gave examples ... (CAQA).

QAA underscores ... that working with a wide range of stakeholders is a key feature of the agency's approach. (...) QAA consults stakeholders (...) Stakeholders from business and industry are widely consulted and directly involved in the development of standards for quality

„Stakeholders“ in EQAR’s Use and Interpretation

3.1 Activities, policy and processes for quality assurance

Reports should at least demonstrate:

-
- How stakeholders are involved in the agency.
- ...

3.3 Independence

.....

3.7 Cyclical external review of agencies

.....

2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose

Reports should at least demonstrate:

- ...
- How stakeholders are involved in the design and continuous improvement of the agency’s processes.

2.3 Implementing processes

.....

Stakeholder classification

| External Stakeholder (1.1) | | Internal Stakeholder (1.1) | |
|-------------------------------|--|---|---|
| Society at large (1.9) | Professional world Employers Trade unions International experts | HE Institution (Part 1) Providers | Leadership (1.1) Departements etc. (1.1) |
| Governments (3.3) | Politicians Civil servants | Staff (1.1) | Assessors (1.3) |
| | Funders / funding bodies | | Teaching staff (1.5) |
| | HE agencies | | Tutors, counsellors (1.6) |
| ENIC/NARIC (1.4) | | Students (1.1,1.2,1.3, 1.4, 1.5, 1.6, 1.9) | |

Lessons learnt

- „Stakeholder Involvement“ is rather a principle than a concrete requirement.
- Stakeholder involvement is not a threat to independence.
- Context and legal framework shape how it is put to practice.
- The Classification of stakeholders is relative.
- A common distinction is external and internal stakeholders.
- A common stakeholder group are the students.
- The most important (and fragile stakeholder) group are the students.



Thank you for your attention
Questions?

enqa.eu

