Guide for effective stakeholders’ involvement in QA

Lucien Bollaert - International QA expert
Ghent University | AEQES | EQ-Arts
Co-author with Stefan Delplace of ESQA Guide

CEENQA webinar
19 May 2021
## Guide for effective stakeholders’ involvement in QA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction to the Guide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Related ESGs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the themes &amp; Guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool to identify degree of stakeholders involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow-up: Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Q &amp; A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ‘Guide for effective stakeholders’ involvement in QA’ is last deliverable in ESQA project conceived before the Covid-19 outbreak.

The Guide is the work of 2 experts in close collaboration with the ESQA partners.

Coordinator: Ministry of Education - Romania
Partners: European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA), European Association of Institutions in Higher Education (EURASHE), European Students’ Union (ESU), Romanian Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ARACIS), High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher education (HCERES) - France, National Evaluation and Accreditation Agency (NEAA) - Bulgaria, The Danish Accreditation Institution (DAI), National Agency for Quality Assurance in Education and Research (ANACEC) - Republic of Moldova
• Underlying concepts and principles are that QA embedded in diverse national and cultural political and HE contexts as well as quality itself and QA are contextually influenced.

• The Guide does not prescribe anything as the ESG, but wants to give generic inspiring guidelines and guiding elements towards the realisation of effective stakeholder involvement.

• Effective stakeholder involvement is defined as stakeholder involvement that has a positive impact on the quality of HE.

• The Guide is informed by the ESQA Study, other surveys and research as well as practical experience.

• The Guide primarily addresses the QA agencies and national authorities, but it may also be inspiring to all stakeholders and outside the EHEA.

• The Guide mainly deals with External QA.
The European stakeholders model in the ESG QA Framework

- **ESG 2.2: Designing Methodologies Fit For Purpose**
  
  (...) **Stakeholders** should be involved in its design and continuous improvement.

- **ESG 2.4: Peer-review experts**
  
  External QA should be carried out by a group of **external experts** that include (a) **student member(s)**.

- **ESG 3.1: Activities, Policy and Processes for QA**
  
  (...) Agencies should ensure the **involvement of stakeholders in their governance and work**.

- **ESG 3.3: Independence**
  
  Agencies should be independent and act autonomously. They should have full responsibility for their operations and the outcomes of those operations **without third party influence**.

- **ESG 1.1: Policy for QA**
  
  **Internal stakeholders** should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while **involving external stakeholders**.

- **ESG 1.2: Design and Approval of Programmes: reference to NQF and QF-EHEA**
Guide for effective stakeholders' involvement in QA

INTRODUCTION: scope, objective, concepts, methodology and structure

Theme 1: Sharing underlying concepts of quality in HE and QA systems

Theme 2: Diversity of categories of stakeholders and their different roles, especially in consultations

Theme 3: Objectives of stakeholders’ involvement

Theme 4: Recruitment/Selection of stakeholders

Theme 5: Training of stakeholders

Theme 6: Involvement of stakeholders in reviews

Theme 7: Involvement of stakeholders in the governance and organisation of QA agencies

Theme 8: Independence vis-à-vis stakeholders’ involvement

Theme 9: Communication and transparency towards stakeholders

Theme 10: Strategic approach to stakeholders’ engagement and supporting activities

Phase identification tool
Structure of the ‘Guide’ under each theme:

• Introduction to the guideline describing shortly context and findings

The Guideline is an **inspiring** statement of the **ultimately best situation** and/or a (morally) required **action** to arrive at such an excellent situation in which **the stakeholders’ involvement is most effective/impactful in the quality of HE, the QA system and/or the EQA activities of QA agencies.**

• Guiding elements towards realisation:
  • From generic or holistic to practical, topical and detailed
  • Making clear the **addressee(s)**
Theme 1: Sharing underlying concepts of quality in HE and QA systems

The underlying concepts of quality and QA systems, as embedded in the HE system, should be shared and co-created involving relevant stakeholders. This way a commitment is built which is embedded in a quality culture that is based on trust and mutual understanding.

Guiding elements towards realisation:

• **All stakeholders** and **QA agencies** should always keep in mind the underlying concepts. Sharing them is the ultimate basis for an effective commitment by all stakeholders.

• Make sure that **all stakeholders** and **QA agencies** have a good knowledge of the political and cultural context, and can work strategically as well as tactically within those contexts.

• **QA agencies:**
  • May organise open dialogues about the underlying concepts.
  • Should bear in mind and accept that stakeholders can have quite different views and should therefore be approached to commit themselves in different ways
  • Involve stakeholders in collaborative partnerships rather than merely consulting them.
**Theme 2: Diversity of categories of stakeholders and their different roles, esp. consultations**

All identified and relevant stakeholders that have an interest in the quality of HE should be **systematically** involved, especially when (re)designing a QA system. This may lead to more openness, transparency, and effective stakeholder involvement based on co-ownership.

**Theme 3: Objectives of stakeholders’ involvement**

Be **explicit and transparent** in sharing in a collective way the **different objectives** of the stakeholder categories, in order to raise the effectiveness of their involvement.

As stakeholders are not a single, homogenous group, dealing with them requires a **diversified approach**; this may imply that their involvement is ‘unequal’ and happens at different stages.
Theme 4: Recruitment/Selection of stakeholders

The selection methods should be clear, publicly known and used consistently by the agency and all stakeholders, including the national authorities.

The recruitment methods may vary among the stakeholder groups. While nomination by the stakeholder’s organisation is a sign of greater trust and independence, selection by the agency on the basis of clear criteria can help find a better candidate as far as vision, knowledge, experience and commitment are concerned. A combination of both has better chances of selecting more engaged stakeholders.

Preparatory meetings should best be held with the nominating stakeholders’ organisations in order to elucidate roles and expectations of the future representatives.

Theme 5: Training of stakeholders

Well-prepared knowledge transfer about HE and QA should be organised in order to raise the commitment of stakeholders in the governance and work of the QA agency.

Trainings for review panel members should be obligatory for admission to pools of new experts as well as for actual evaluations. The trainings should be informative and develop the trainees’ review skills in practice. Briefings must be held before any review.
Theme 6: Involvement of stakeholders in reviews

Review panels should contain all perspectives of the institution, programme and/or topics under review. If the subjects are the QA processes and the output of a HEI or study programme, the perspectives are those of learners (student), teachers (academic peer/expert), of the institution (senior manager), the professional field and of the future lives of the graduates (employer and/or alumni). The opinions of all review panel members should receive equal attention during the review and decision processes, irrespective of their different roles and duties.

The international perspective is important in a review panel in the context of global HE and certainly when the HEI or study programme has a specific international strategy and/or dimension.

Theme 7: Involvement of stakeholders in the governance & organization of QAAs

The categories of the stakeholders and their degree of engagement are related to the mission and strategy of a QA agency as well as to the national QA system. Consequently, all relevant and identified stakeholders should be involved in internal and external QA activities of the agency. Relevant stakeholders’ categories are those that reflect the opinions in the wider society linked to the quality of HE.
Theme 8: Independence stakeholders’ involvement

The involvement of stakeholders should be organised in such a way that the independence of the QA system, the governance and activities of the agency are enhanced.

Theme 9: Communication and transparency towards stakeholders

Communication and transparency with all stakeholders should be considered as essential and strategic building blocks of a QA that functions as an effective stakeholders’ model, in which there is a culture of co-creating and sharing of knowledge and practice.

Theme 10: Strategic approach to stakeholder engagement and supporting activities

Stakeholder involvement which is aimed at having a qualitative impact should be integrated in the agency’s strategic policy, and should also be linked to other policies, such as structural development, networking, communication and the agency’s own internal QA.
Guide for effective stakeholders’ involvement in QA

Phase identification tool

Non-lineair and non-automatic model or tool to identify the degree or development phase of stakeholders’ involvement in 4 phases
Guide for effective stakeholders’ involvement in QA

follow-up: questionnaire

Questionnaire: [https://esqa.ro/questionnaire/](https://esqa.ro/questionnaire/)

✓ Has your knowledge on stakeholder’s involvement improved by reading the Study on Stakeholder Involvement in EQA?

✓ Do you think that the Guide on involvement of stakeholders’ in QA activities is relevant for you/your organization?

✓ Have you identified at least one additional category of stakeholders that you intend to tackle in the future or at least on direction of improvement of your current practices?
THANK YOU!

Q & A